Analysis of OpenStreetMap data quality at different stages of a participatory mapping process: Evidence from informal urban settings

Godwin Yeboah, Rafael Troilo, Vangelis Pitidis, João Porto de Albuquerque



NIHR Global Health Research Unit on Improving Health in Slums

Overview

- Introduction
- Participatory mapping process
- Definition of mapping stages
- Current results from mapping stages
- Summary of findings
- Potential future opportunities

Research questions

- What is the level of spatial data quality one can expect at different stages of the mapping process leading to final update of the OpenStreetMap database?
- What are the factors influencing quality?

One thing we are doing differently is that we are systematically adapting OpenStreetMap to develop a spatially-regulated sampling method in health research in a multi-country informal urban setting.

Improving Health in Slums Collaborative (2019), **A protocol for a multi-site, spatially-referenced household survey in slum settings: methods for access, sampling frame construction, sampling, and field data collection**. BMC Medical Research Methodology, 19. 109. doi:10.1186/s12874-019-0732-x

Our ongoing project: title and goals



National Institute for Health Research (NIHR) Global Health Research Unit on Improving Health in Slums at University of Warwick

Work packages (WPs) in the project



A methodological challenge

Combination of methods from geospatial data science and social research to tackle a methodological challenge:

Spatial Data Quality

- completeness;
- *logical consistency;*
- positional,
- temporal and
- thematic accuracy

Community Engagement

Methodological Challenge

- capacity building,
- empowerment,
- local ownership,
- sustainability

Project partners (study sites)



Background Terms of Use

Sample images of Azam Basti slum

Satellite image

Building structures on the ground





Sample images of Sasa slum

Satellite image



Building structures on the ground



Sample images of Korogocho slum

Satellite image



Building structures on the ground



Participatory mapping process



Participants and mapathon statistics: all sites



Participants and online mapping events Involving the local community

• Local partners and community: mapping and reflecting on space



Bangladesh mapathon



Nigeria mapathon

Sample photos of ground-truthing/field work Involving the local community



Bangladesh field work



Kenya field work

Conceptual definition of mapping stages



Mapping stages – Azam Basti (Buildings)





Mapping stages – Sasa (Buildings)



Mapping stages – Korogocho (Buildings)



Mapping stages – Azam Basti (Roads/Footpaths)



Mapping stages - Sasa (Roads/Footpaths)



Mapping stages – Korogocho (Roads/Footpaths)

		Stage 1						!	Stage 2								1												St	ag	ge	3	<u> </u>										1	
2	80	B	efore	ma	ppi	ng			;	С	Dnli	ne val	ma ida	pp tic	ing n	; &		:							Gı	rou	inc	l tr	ut	hin	g 8	& s	am	npli	ing	; fra	am	e						
10 14 11 11	.60								į.									į.																										
	.40								<u> </u> -									 																										÷
	.20								i																																			÷
¹ NESS	.00								į.																																			!
LETE	60							_		-	~			۹.,			_																	•										-
COMP	40													Сс	on	np	let	er	nes	SS	d	iffe	ere	en	tia	l (Ro	bac	ds)): 3	848	8%			÷									
•	20								:																																			:
	200.00.00110 01 7 10C	2017-10-01700:002 2017-10-08700:002 2017-10-15700:002 2017-10-22700:002	2017-10-29T00:00:002 2017-11-05T00:00:002 2017-11-13T00:00:002	2017-11-19T00:002 2017-11-26T00:00:002	2017-12-03T00:00:002 2017-12-10T00:00:002	2017-12-17T00:00:002 2017-12-24T00:00:002	2017-12-31T00:00:002 2018-01-07T00:00:002	2018-01-14T00:00:002 2018-01-21T00:00:002	2018-01-28T00:00:00 2018-01-28T00:00:002	2018-02-04100:002 2018-02-11700:00:002	2018-02-18T00:002 2018-02-25T00:00:002	2018-03-04T00:00:002 2018-03-11T00:002	2018-03-18T00:00:002	200:00:00:00:00:002	2018-04-08T00:00:002 2018-04-15T00:00:002	2018-04-22T00:00:002	2018-04-29T00:00:002 2018-05-06T00:00:002	2018-05-13T00:00:00 2018-05-13T00:002	2018-05-27T00:00:002	2018-06-03T00:00:002 2018-06-10T00:002	2018-06-17700:00:002	2018-06-24T00:00:002 2018-07-01T00:00:002	2018-07-08T00:00:002	2018-07-15T00:00:002 2018-07-22T00:00:002	2018-07-29T00:00:002	2018-08-05T00:00:002 2018-08-12T00:00:002	2018-08-19T00:00:00Z	2018-08-26T00:00:002 2018-09-02T00:00:002	2018-09-09T00:00:00Z	2018-09-16T00:00:002	2018-09-30T00:00:00Z	2018-10-07700:00:002 2018-10-14700:002	2018-10-21T00:00:00Z	2018-10-28T00:00:002 2018-11-04T00:002	2018-11-11T00:00:002	2018-11-18T00:00:002 2018-11-25T00:002	2018-12-02T00:00:002	2018-12-16T00:00:002	2018-12-23T00:00:002 2018-12-30T00:00:002	2019-01-06T00:00:00Z	2019-01-20T00:00:002	2019-01-27700:00:002 2019-02-03700:00:002	2019-02-10T00:00:002 2019-02-17T00:00:002	2019-02-24T00:00:002 2019-03-03T00:00:002
																		Т	IM	IE (Η	ou	JR	LY))																			

Modification of OSM Buildings – Azam Basti



Modification of OSM Buildings – Sasa



Modification of OSM Buildings – Korogocho



Factors influencing quality (i): density of buildings



Factors influencing quality (ii): roof top architecture

Relatively difficult interpretation

Relatively easy interpretation

Azam Basti



Sasa



Improving Health in Slums

Korogocho

Factors influencing quality (iii): Computer skills, mapping skills and knowledge of tools



- Capacity building is essential for slum community engagement in mapping activities
- Slum residents are the "local experts" with local knowledge.

Summary of findings

- OpenStreetMap for health survey in informal urban settings
 - Ground-truthing is essential for areas with high density of buildings. Groundtruth estimates are about 1%-37% less than online mapping estimates.
 - Less dense areas can reasonably be used as a sampling frame without ground-truthing.
 - Roads are easy to interpret, useful and must be mapped at all stages. Groundtruth estimates are about 11% - 248% more than online mapping estimates.
 - Factors influencing data quality: density, roof top architecture, mapping skills, etc.
- The obsome platform was very useful for historical OSM data analytics.
- Towards a framework for understanding spatial data quality at different mapping stages leading to OpenStreetMap update.

Potential future opportunities

- Combining participatory mapping and automated methods (e.g. machine-learning) for structure detection and population estimation (pilot ongoing)
- Improvement of workflows and mapping tools in support of a methodological framework for geospatial mapping health and wellbeing in urban poor areas
- Extending impact: potential future collaboration with local partners, OSM Community, and other researchers for data usage and further improvement

Thank You!

- Volunteers from the OpenStreetMap community, HOT and missing maps
- Collaborators and funders:



In collaboration with:





Acknowledgment and disclaimer

This research was funded by the National Institute for Health Research (NIHR) Global Health Research Group on Improving Health in Slums. The views expressed in this presentation are those of the author(s) and not necessarily those of the NHS, the NIHR, or the Department of Health and Social Care.

